MANAGING BIAS IN DENTAL HYGIENE PATIENT CARE

BY: JESSICA SUEDECK, RDH, MSDH AND EMILY LUDWIG, RDH, MSDH
OLD DOMINION UNIVERSITY
NORFOLK, VIRGINIA
2020

OBJECTIVES

• DEFINE EXPLICIT AND IMPLICIT BIAS.
• COMPARISON AND CONTRAST EXPLICIT AND IMPLICIT BIAS.
• DISCUSS THE IMPACT OF BIAS ON DENTAL HYGIENE PATIENT CARE.
• IDENTIFY MEANS TO SELF-ASSESS IMPLICIT BIAS.
• RECOGNIZE WAYS TO MANAGE IMPLICIT BIAS.

WHAT IS BIAS?

• PREFERENCE OR AVERSION TO A PERSON OR GROUP OF PEOPLE COMPARED TO ANOTHER
• THIS MAY INFLUENCE JUDGEMENTS, DECISIONS, TREATMENTS, ETC.
• CONSCIOUS AND UNCONSCIOUS
TYPES OF BIAS

**EXPLICIT BIAS**
- Person is aware of the bias
- Bias is conveyed directly
- Bias works in a conscious manner
- Voluntarily activated
- Planned action
  - Example: “I prefer to treat fit patients more than obese patients.”

**IMPLICIT BIAS**
- Person is unaware of bias
- Bias is conveyed indirectly
- Bias works subconsciously
- Involuntarily activated
- Spontaneous action
  - Example: Sitting further away from an obese person than a skinny person.

**IMPACT OF BIAS**
- Contribute to disparities in healthcare
- Impact quality of care received
- Negatively impact health outcomes
EXPRESSION OF UNCONSCIOUS PREFERENCES

- Using a dominant or condescending tone
- Allocating time differently
- Failing to provide interpreters
- Doing more or less diagnostic work
- Failure to treat pain aggressively
- Recommending different treatment options based on assumptions about adherence

IMPACT IN DENTISTRY

- Minimal research in dentistry; even less in dental hygiene specifically
- Take lessons from healthcare research in general
- CoBRAS in dental research

NOW THAT I KNOW MY UNCONSCIOUS BIASES CAN IMPACT THE DENTAL HYGIENE CARE I PROVIDE—HOW DO I DETECT AND COMBAT MY OWN IMPLICIT BIASES?
IMPLICIT ASSOCIATIONS TEST

MANAGING IMPLICIT BIAS

• Early, Habitual Interventions
• Workshops & Training
• CE Courses
• Self-Assessments
• Role-Playing

• Sukhara et al.
• 6-Point Framework for Integrating Bias Training into Healthcare Education
• CoBRAS
• Online IAT
6-POINT FRAMEWORK

- Overall Program: Safe, non-threatening learning context
- Evidence-based information to increase knowledge
- Emphasis on how implicit bias influences behavior and patient outcomes
- Increase self-awareness
- Conscious efforts to overcome implicit bias
- Enhancing awareness

USING THE COBRAS FOR SELF-ASSESSMENT

- For self-evaluation, this can only be used once before the person knows:
  - Which subscales an item fall under
  - How to score
- Once you take the test, you can score yourself and find areas that need improvement
- Use in conjunction with 6-POINT FRAMEWORK

STRATEGIES TO INDIVIDUALLY ADDRESS IMPLICIT BIAS

- Focus on seeing people as individuals and notice assumptions and stereotypes.
- Take the implicit associations test (IAT) and/or Color-Blind Racial Attitudes Scale.
  [https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html](https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html)
- Notice what triggers assumptions and work on consciously changing your stereotypes.
- Increase exposure to people who counter stereotypes.
- Engage in education about implicit bias.
STRATEGIES TO INDIVIDUALLY ADDRESS IMPLICIT BIAS

- Become cognizant of cues others offer about themselves and the context of the situation.
- Try to see things from another's point of view. Evaluate how you would react if you were in a similar situation.
- Withhold making a judgment until you have additional information and you have reviewed and reflected on personal assumptions and stereotypes.
- Engage in deliberate self-awareness.
- Review media avenues focusing on alleviating prejudice and discrimination.

CONCLUSIONS

Disparities in healthcare have been and continue to be a concern.

Explicit and implicit biases impact provider understanding, actions, communication, care planning, treatment decisions, and more.

Dental hygienists need to self-identify biases that impact care in order to manage them during patient care delivery.
Color-Blind Racial Attitudes Scale SCORING INFORMATION

Directions. Below is a set of questions that deal with social issues in the United States (U.S.). Using the 6-point scale, please give your honest rating about the degree to which you personally agree or disagree with each statement. Please be as open and honest as you can; there are no right or wrong answers. Record your response to the left of each item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. ____ Everyone who works hard, no matter what race they are, has an equal chance to become rich.
2. ____ Race plays a major role in the type of social services (such as type of health care or day care) that people receive in the U.S.
3. ____ It is important that people begin to think of themselves as American and not African American, Mexican American or Italian American.
4. ____ Due to racial discrimination, programs such as affirmative action are necessary to help create equality.
5. ____ Racism is a major problem in the U.S.
6. ____ Race is very important in determining who is successful and who is not.
7. ____ Racism may have been a problem in the past, but it is not an important problem today.
8. ____ Racial and ethnic minorities do not have the same opportunities as White people in the U.S.
9. ____ White people in the U.S. are discriminated against because of the color their skin.
10. ____ Talking about racial issues causes unnecessary tension.
11. ____ It is important for political leaders to talk about racism to help work through or solve society’s problems.
12. ____ White people in the U.S. have certain advantages because of the color of their skin.
13. ____ Immigrants should try to fit into the culture and adopt the values of the U.S.
14. ____ English should be the only official language in the U.S.
15. ____ White people are more to blame for racial discrimination in the U.S. than racial and ethnic minorities.
16. ____ Social policies, such as affirmative action, discriminate unfairly against White people.
17. ____ It is important for public schools to teach about the history and contributions of racial and ethnic minorities.
18. ____ Racial and ethnic minorities in the U.S. have certain advantages because of the color of their skin.
19. ____ Racial problems in the U.S. are rare, isolated situations.
20. ____ Race plays an important role in who gets sent to prison.
Self-Scoring Sheet

Please pay attention to how to score before totaling responses. Specific questions are scored different ways. We will go over this as a group and then give you time to individually score.

Factor 1: ___ +___ +___ +___ +___ +___ +___ =_____ (total)  LOW MODERATE HIGH (circle one)

Factor 2: ___ +___ +___ +___ +___ +___ +___ =_____ (total)  LOW MODERATE HIGH (circle one)

Factor 3: ___ +___ +___ +___ +___ +___ =_____ (total)  LOW MODERATE HIGH (circle one)

TOTAL COBRAS:  Factor 1 _______+ Factor 2 ________+ Factor 3 ________=__________
LOW MODERATE HIGH (circle one)
# Implicit Association Test

To access the various online IAT modules created by Project Implicit®, visit:

[https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html](https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to distinguish old from young faces. This test often indicates that Americans have automatic preference for young over old.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weight IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to distinguish faces of people who are obese and people who are thin. It often reveals an automatic preference for thin people relative to fat people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender-Career IAT</td>
<td>This IAT often reveals a relative link between family and females and between career and males.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weapons IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize White and Black faces, and images of weapons or harmless objects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab-Muslim IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to distinguish names that are likely to belong to Arab-Muslims versus people of other nationalities or religions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skin-tone IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize light and dark-skinned faces. It often reveals an automatic preference for light-skin relative to dark-skin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires some familiarity with religions terms from various world religions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize White and Asian-American faces, and images of places that are either American or Foreign in origin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presidents IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize photos of Donald Trump and one or more previous presidents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to distinguish faces of European and African origin. It indicates that most Americans have an automatic preference for white over black.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize symbols representing abled and disabled individuals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexuality IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to distinguish words and symbols representing gay and straight people. It often reveals an automatic preference for straight relative to gay people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender-Science IAT</td>
<td>This IAT often reveals a relative link between liberal arts and females and between science and males.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native IAT</td>
<td>This IAT requires the ability to recognize White and Native American faces in either classic or modern dress, and the names of places that are either American or Foreign in origin.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright © Project Implicit
References


